

ERETO

WHAT NCA RESIDENTS SAY ABOUT ERETO PERFORMANCE AND POSSIBLE EXPANSION OF THE PROGRAMME

HELD ON 11TH DEC. 2002 - 13TH DEC 2002

FACILITATED BY:

ALFRED SAKAFU &
ALAIS MORINDAT

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

ERETO programme has been in operation in Ngorongoro Division for the past five years. During the 5 years of operation, the programme's main focus was livestock restocking provision of livestock and water services. The programme adopted different approaches such as the use of traditional structures and system, also sub-contracting other organizations to carry out activities.

During the implementation process, the programme went through many experiences and learnt many lessons, which can be used somewhere else. Now ERETO programme wants to expand geographically and thematically. Studies and assessments have been carried out to find out how the expansion should be carried out.

This report is about the views of the community representatives of the people living in Ngorongoro Division. It involved traditional men and women leaders as well as some councilors. The exercise looked into a number of issues and people came up with various recommendations.

People agreed that the programme should fall under the Ministries of Natural Resources and Tourism and the Ministry of Water and Livestock Development. They did not want the programme to expand geographically, but thematically. They recommended that there was a need to improve the relationship between the PC, NCAA and ERETO and to build their capacity in terms of development programme planning, implementation and monitoring. They emphasized that development programmes should be people focused and sustainable especially after donor funding. Therefore, it was recommended that efforts should be made to facilitate the formation of effective community based development organizations, which will be able to establish and manage development programmes.

It was realized that the nature of economic development programmes in the area, led to conflicting interest among development players. Therefore, there was a need of establishing or strengthening bodies involved with conflict resolutions in the area. In addition, there was a need for people to be educated on various Government policies, which affect them and learn lobbying and advocacy skills. It was emphasized that people should be trained on their basic and human rights.

People are ready for positive development and need participation in the development processes.

ERETO

1. RESPONSIBLE MINISTRIES

ERETO operates within the NCAA geographical area; therefore, the Ministry of Natural Resources and Tourism has been regarded as the programme parent ministry. During the review workshop, all participants said that ERETO should fall under more than one ministry, because of the nature of the activities supported by the programme.

It was recommended by all participants that ERETO should fall under two ministries: The Ministry of Natural Resources and Tourism and the Ministry of Water and Livestock Development. Few felt that besides the two key ministries, the Ministry of Education, the Ministry of Community Development, Women and Children, and the Ministry of Law should strongly feature in the development processes of the area.

People expressed that ERETO programmes was covering many development programmes such as poverty reduction, livestock, water, community empowerment especially women etc. Therefore, they saw ERETO as an integrated development programme with a potential feature for thermal expansion. The other reason people felt that ERETO operational area was a controversial development area, which had a number of players with different development interests. Therefore, there was need for more than one ministry to work together in planning and supporting the development of the area. They also felt that inter-ministerial development approach would promote democracy in the area.

2. PARTNERSHIP BETWEEN PASTORALIST COUNCIL AND NCAA

It was clear to all participants that there was a partnership between NCAA and the PC and that the PC was a creation or a baby of NCAA. They all agreed that the nature of the partnership that existed between the two bodies was imbalance. The PC was entirely financially dependent on the NCAA. Therefore, it had no decision-making powers, NCAA controlled it. They felt that the PC lacked planning and implementing capacity. Therefore, it was used for approving and implementing NCAA development plans.

They emphasized that the partnership between the PC and NCAA should continue, and should be improved. The improvement should aim at empowering the PC in terms of decision-making, capacity building in planning and implementing development programmes. Some felt that the budget should be increased and that the PC Constitution should ensure that the NCAA does not control the PC.

Participants felt that there was a need of improving democracy in the PC by increasing the number of elected members from 3- 5 for each ward. They proposed that the number of women in the Pastoralist Council should be increased from 6 to 12 members. Many participants recommended that their communities should elect PC members; therefore, they should not be members of the PC on the basis of their administrative or political status.

It was recommended that the partnership should be established under an agreed Memorandum of Understanding and all parties should adhere to the Memorandum of Understanding.

It was emphasized that the agreement reached by different partners should be honoured. For example, each partner should contribute towards the programme as agreed in the Memorandum of Understanding.

3. THEMATIC PROGRAMME COVERAGE

It was recommended by all participants that thematically the programme should focus on two main areas: implementation of development projects and improvement of policies and laws. The second recommendation meant that ERETO should engage in lobbying and advocacy work.

As far as programme developments were concerned, they recommended that ERETO should cover basic social services and income generation projects. Their main concern in social services was mainly on education, provision of human and livestock health services, water for livestock and human consumption. They felt that the Owoloto programme should continue at the same timesavings and credit schemes should be introduced. They also felt that ERETO should facilitate processes, which improve food security in the area and the availability and accessibility of water to both livestock and people.

People felt that the above recommendations would not be achieved unless certain policies and laws were improved. The policies that need improvement in order to improve the lives of people of Ngorongoro included:

- Land policy
- Water and Livestock Development Policy
- Wildlife and Tourism Policies
- Education and Health Policies
- Trade and Marketing Policies
- Environment Policy

It was pointed out that most leaders at different levels were not conversant with Government policies and the problem applied to all people at grassroots levels. Therefore, people came out with a number of recommendations:

- **Awareness Creation:**

It was recommended that deliberate measures should be taken to educate leaders and communities on various policies especially those that had direct impact on the daily lives of people. The education should be extended to the grassroots.

- **Involvement of Beneficiaries**

They emphasized that development organizations workers, and the Government should adopt participatory development methods, which will enable beneficiaries to participate in the preparation of policies that affect them.

- **Policies to Protect the Basic and Human Rights of People**

Participants recommended that policies should ensure that they were there to protect the basic and human rights of the people and the best use of the resources for the benefit of the people in the area.

Therefore, they said policies should aim at poverty eradication and not otherwise.

4. PROGRAMME SUSTAINABILITY

People realized that there was a need for ERETO in collaboration with communities to come up with strategies of sustaining the programme especially after donor funding. They came up with a number of recommendations:

- **Community Project Ownership**

It was emphasized that more efforts should be made to educate community members to understand that ERETO programme was theirs. They pointed out that the current approach of operating the OWOLOTO project, which required communities to contribute about 44.4% towards the project to a large extent, it ensured sustainability of the OWOLUTO even after donor funding.

- **The Use of Traditional Structures and Systems**

They felt that ERETO approach of using traditional leadership machinery and systems, helped to install the spirit of community ownership of projects. People felt that there was a need to build the capacity of traditional leaders e.g. awareness creation of key issues and policies, exposure etc.

- Personnel
It was recommended that the programme should employ competent and committed staff in all fields being addressed by ERETO.
- Capacity Building of Committees
People felt that for the programme to be sustainable, it has to have a strong base at community level. Therefore, it was recommended that all programme committees at village; ward and project levels should be strengthened.
- Formation of a Community Based Organization:
It was recommended that the programme should facilitate processes which will enable various committees to join and form a CBO which eventually should be registered and take over the running of the programme after the donor funding. The other approach could be to facilitate the current ERETO to become an NGO.
- Phasing Out and Phasing In Processes
Once a local organization is established, the current ERETO should prepare strategies of phasing out of the existing ERETO and the phasing in of the new organization. This could mean ERETO changing its roles from those of direct implementation to those of facilitating, monitoring, advising and enabling.

5. GEOGRAPHICAL EXPANSION

All participants were not in favour of the ERETO programme expanding to the rest of the district. They came up with a number of reasons for not expanding ERETO beyond Ngorongoro Division.

- Poverty Reduction Exercise
They said that the original idea was to introduce ERETO to tackle the problem of poverty in the division, which was somehow related to national policies, which led to food insecurity, and poverty in general. They really appreciated the achievements of ERETO in addressing that problem, yet they felt that the programme in Ngorongoro Division had not reached many real poor. Therefore, they emphasized that instead of expanding the programme; it should be consolidated so as to have better impact than what it is now.
- CBOs and NGOs Presence
Participants said that Ngorongoro Division, unlike other divisions in the district, had no CBOs and NGOs to carry out development programme. For example, they cited Loliondo, which had a number of NGOs, CBOs and

private investors working in the area. Some of the organizations pointed out included LADO, LOSADEI, TAZAMA, OXFAM and Mwarabu. In Ngorongoro Division, they said there was only ERETO programme that supported communities. Somehow, people did not mention that NCAA and PC were contributing towards the development of the area. They knew that the PC was getting about TShs. 560 million, yet they did not see the impact of that money. Unfortunately, these organizations have not shown interest of expanding to Ngorongoro Division.

- Food Security
They felt that their area was vulnerable to food insecurity due to the conservation policies, which did not allow them to cultivate while in other areas that policy did not apply. Therefore, they felt that ERETO still had a lot to do in terms of promoting food security in the area without antagonizing with NCAA.
- Solidarity
It was expressed that people of Ngorongoro due to their historical development problems and ethnical background, have a stronger solidarity than other people in the district. Therefore, they feel that the process of joining others could undermine their solidarity.

6. **EWOLOTO PROJECT TO CONTINUE OR NOT**

All people insisted that the EWOLOTO project should continue for a number of reasons as follows: -

- So far not all real poor people have been reached by the programme; therefore, there is a need for the programme to continue addressing all target people
- The livelihood of the people of Ngorongoro division to a large extent depends on livestock, while in other places, people depend on mixed farming. Little efforts have been made to promote the type of tourism that stimulates the growth of local entrepreneurships.

People also came out with some recommendations on how to improve the Owoloto project. They proposed that the Owoloto project should consider the possibilities of introducing dairy cows or meat cow with an idea of capturing the tourist hotels' demands and the export sector.

- There were also recommendations that part of the Owoloto project fund should cover other projects such as water, education, veterinary services, food storages (godowns), and training of local communities on how to participate effectively in tourism.

7. PRIVATIZATION OF WATER AND VETERINARY SERVICES

most people were in favour of the current ERETO approach of facilitating the provision of water and veterinary services to communities by sub-contracting to private people or companies. They said the approach ensured them good quality of services all the time, and on site.

They recommended that in the long run, ERETO should train youths from the community on how to manage the services to minimize external dependence and to promote useful employment within the community, which will eventually have social, and economic multiplier effects.

It was emphasized that while privatizing the services, ERETO should ensure that the poor have access to those services, otherwise a project like OWOLOTO will be meaningless.

- They recommended that there should be a system or body, which will monitor the private sector to ensure that the nature of services provided does not promote poverty in the area.
- They said that good traditional customs of managing water system and of eradicating poverty should be incorporated in the new system so that the poor and vulnerable groups are protected from marginalization processes.

8. THEMATIC EXPANSION

All people felt that there was a need for expanding the programme thematically. The expansion they said, should adopt two approaches: First, should aim at the consolidation of what is already on the ground, second select few strategic themes which will lay a base for future development in the area. Therefore, the new areas recommended included education, health for people, communication, establishment of security posts in sensitive areas such as Oldupai, Kakesio, Inainokanoka, Masek; Keprajiro, markets. Other areas recommended were improvement of women empowerment etc.

As far as empowerment was concerned, they recommended that it should focus on improving and empowering community representative structures, training on financial management skills, strengthening of community groups' or village funds, and entrepreneurship skills to groups. They also said people; especially community representatives should be trained on basic and human rights focusing on land rights. They emphasized that ERETO programme as far as education was concerned, should facilitate the expansion of secondary school education and vocational trainings.

9. LOBBYING AND ADVOCACY

It was agreed by all participants that, there was a need for ERETO programme to be involved in lobbying and advocacy work because of a number of reasons.

- The Vulnerability of the People of Ngorongoro Ward
It was pointed out that the various conflicting development interests that exist in the area needed lobbying and advocacy skills for any one to work or live successfully in the area.
- Existence
Land is every thing to any community. It determines someone's nationality or ethnical recognition; it is the base of the livelihood of the majority. Therefore, participants recommended that ERETO programme should train people on land rights. They said they should also be trained on the rights of having access to food environment etc. Therefore, people needed skills on effective lobbying and advocacy.

10. THE PROBLEM OF HIV/AIDS

The issue of HIV/AIDS was seen as a big threat to the survival of the pastoralist communities, because of a number of reasons. For example, they realized that some of the cultures and customs facilitated the spread of HIV/AIDS. Most literature on HIV/AIDS was in English or Kiswahili, languages not spoken by a good population of pastoralists. Within communities, there were few television or cinema facilities; therefore, the majority of the population could not learn the issue through media except radios. Therefore, people recommended that serious measures should be taken by the Government, community leaders, PC, ERETO, NCAA, the Ngorongoro District Council and other players to address the HIV/AIDS problem. Some of the recommendations were as follows:

- Awareness Creation on HIV/AIDS
They said awareness creation on HIV/AIDS should be focused. It should focus on community groups, culture, causes of infection, how to prevent etc.
- Causes of infection
They recommended that people should be trained on how people can get HIV infection e.g. by sharing sharp objects such as injections, razor blades, tooth brush, knives etc.
- Training of Traditional Birth Attendants and Ngaribas (those who carry out circumcision exercise)

They realized that the two groups were very important in the society, yet they were vulnerable to HIV/AIDS infections at the same time, they could be potential spreaders of HIV/AIDS. Therefore, it was recommended that they should be trained on how to carry out their activities safely.

- **The Orbo Ingipot, Oloip and Esoto Culture**
It was highly recommended that there should be awareness creation among youth on the importance of changing or improving bad cultural practices such as orbo and esoto which brought together young men and women which eventually led them to have unsafe sexual relations.
- **Sharing of Women Based on Age Sets**
It was recommended that this practice should stop; otherwise, it could be one of the sources of spreading HIV/AIDS in the community. Therefore, it was recommended that families should have special rooms for guests.
- **Prostitution**
It was emphasized that measures should be taken to discourage prostitution in the community.
- **Use of Video and Cinemas**
It was reported that many people had not seen people suffering from HIV/AIDS. Therefore, they recommended that trainers on HIV/AIDS should use video and cinemas, so that people can see and hear from various experiences, witnesses and confessions.
- **Community Leaders to Set Examples**
It was agreed that community leaders should set examples in tackling the problem e.g. having rooms specifically for visitors, discouraging esoto and orbo. As leaders, they should ensure that communities implement what has been agreed in addressing the problem.
- **Seminars and Workshops**
Participants recommended that all organizations and institutions involved in development activities in the area should incorporate HIV/AIDS education in their programmes. Therefore, they should facilitate seminars and workshops to create community awareness on the problem.

11. CONFLICT RESOLUTIONS

In principle, it was agreed by all participants within the programme area that there were conflicts at different levels and varied in terms of seriousness. It was pointed out that some of the main reasons behind the conflicts were:

- Lack or poor participation of different stakeholders in decision-making processes on issues that affect them
- Lack of frequent formal and informal meetings which are supposed to address sensitive issues or problems
- Lack of the existence of an effective conflict resolution body catering all stakeholders in the area

Participants came out with various recommendations on how to resolve conflicts in the area. Some of the recommendations were as follows:

- Joint meetings involving PC, ERETO and NCAA.

Participants reported that the three organizations were there to promote the development of the area. Therefore, they recommended that the three bodies should have formal and informal meetings to discuss issues related to the development of the area.

Each organization should develop a culture of inviting other organizations to attend their meetings and let others know their development plans. It was emphasized that meetings will help organizations to work closely, exchange ideas, experiences and skills for the benefit of their institutions and their beneficiaries. The meetings should also include traditional leaders.

- Formation of a Steering Committee
People felt that there was a need of forming a Steering Committee, which will facilitate a harmonized development in the area. The recommended composition of the Steering Committee was as follows:

- 2 representatives from PC
- 2 representatives from NCAA
- 2 representatives from ERETO
- 2 representatives from Traditional leaders
- 2 representatives from women
- 2 representatives from youths

Total 12

- **Staff Meetings Within ERETO**
It was recommended that ERETO should have staff meetings to address organizational issues where required they could involve the EWOLOTO Committee.
- **Laigwanak Meetings**
It was recommended that the Laigwanak meetings should be held at least four times a year to discuss development issues and community based development bodies such as ERETO and PC.
- **Review of the PC Constitution**
People recommended that the Constitution of PC should be reviewed so that it becomes a true peoples' representative body, which is there to address people's problems and to resolve problems in the area.
- **Individual Conflicts**
Participants emphasized that there were no conflicts between ERETO, NCAA and PC. The problems were between leaders of these organizations. The conflicts were mainly a result of differences in development approaches and concepts. The other difference, they said, was due to differences in the level of transparency on the agendas related to their programmes. Some of the problems were mainly a product of personal interests.

12. EDUCATION ON GOVERNMENT POLICIES

During the workshop, it was pointed out in recent years, there have been many Government reforms and structural adjustments, which has led to establishment or adjustment of Government policies and laws. They said, most of the policies had direct impact on the daily lives of people, or in the future development of the country, and most leaders and the public did not know these policies in general. Therefore, participants came up with recommendations on how to disseminate information related to different policies.

- **Training Leaders on Different Policies**
It was recommended that leaders at all levels should be trained on policies which they have to implement or those that have impact on the people they lead. They should be trained through workshops and seminars.
- **Training Communities**
It was emphasized that communities should be made aware of all policies that affect them. The Government should ensure that trained leaders

train their communities or beneficiaries on various policies. The same should apply to organizations carrying out development projects. For example, those implementing social service projects should ensure that people understand policies on social services. People should also be aware of various investment policies especially those that affect them or can enhance their development.

- **Accessibility of Policy Documents**

It was emphasized that policy documents should be accessible to the public in a language understood by all e.g. Kiswahili.

- **Study Visits**

In most cases, the introduction of development policies is accepted differently in different places. It was recommended that where the implementation of certain policies have proved successful, people from other areas should be encouraged to go and see and find out how they adopt them based on their environment.

13. CAPACITY BUILDING OF THE PASTORALIST COUNCIL AND TRADITIONAL LEADERS

People appreciated the importance and the roles of the PC and traditional leaders in the society. They felt that there was a great need to build the capacity of the two bodies to cope up with modern development and leadership. Therefore, participants came up with recommendation on how to improve the two bodies as follows:

- **Leadership Training**

It was recommended that all members of the PC and the traditional leaders should be trained on leadership skills.

- **PC staff**

Participants recommended that they should employ a Secretary and train youths at ward level on communication (journalism) skills. The Council should also employ a full time Manager to run the PC programmes.

- **Increase the Number of Elected Members in the PC**

It was recommended that the number of elected members in the PC should be increased to ensure that the PC is accountable to communities. Therefore, it was recommended that the number should increase as follows:

12 youths from all wards

12 women from all wards

12 Laigwanak from all wards

- Pastoralist Council to Have Legal Status
It was pointed out that currently the legal existence of the PC is based on the NCAA Constitution. Participants recommended that the PC should have its own Constitution and should be legally registered. The move will reduce the current dependence of the Council on the NCAA.
- Bye-Law On Traditional Leaders
Participants realized the roles of the traditional leaders in the area; therefore, they recommended that a byelaw should be introduced to recognize them legally, so that their contributions and decisions can be recognized.

APPENDIX 1

List of Participants:

1. Ngobei Ole Runguna	Nainokanoka, Traditional leader (Alaigwanani),
2. Mathew K. Nassei	Project Manager
3. Letee Ngoidiko	Olbalbal, water committee chair
4. Gaspar Leboy	CD, Ereto
5. Carol Sorensen	TA, Ereto
6. Oldikir Nduyoto	Olbalbal, Alaigwanani
7. Oloitai Alaandare	Olbalbal, Alaigwanani
8. Pelo Ndung'ani	Olbalbal
9. Mwasone Oloirusha	Olbalbal
10. William Ormetili	Nainokanoka, councilor (also, PC)
11. Ndoros Kipera	Endulen
12. Manie Osokoni	Endulen, alaigwanani
13. Mures Mbai	Esere
14. Saimon Naseya	Endulen, alaigwanani
15. Joshua Sanduta	Endulen
16. Noorpiyaya Ngaire	Endulen, women rep.
17. Ringe Lengeju	Endulen
18. Mitaa Lalaa	Endulen
19. James Moringe	PFO, Endulen
20. Naisula Maiko	Olbalbal, women rep.
21. Matingoi Tawo	Nainokanoka, alaigwanani
22. Kaipai Lormunyei	Nainokanoka, alaigwanani
23. Kimirei Saiboku	PFO, Nainokanoka
24. Muumu Olenamba	Nainokanoka
25. Sanago Ole Kombeti	Nainokanoka, women rep.
26. Muriet Ole Siyama	Nainokanoka, women rep.
27. Namuru Mbatina	Nainokanoka, women rep.
28. Moinga Lesasi	PFO, Olbalbal
29. Emmanuel Kotika	Kakesio
30. William Ole Njoye	PFO, Kakesio
31. Marine Kiroshi	PFO, Naiyobi
32. Olemuna Oruuya	Naiyobi, alaigwanani
33. Nginainai Ole Syara	Naiyobi, alaigwanani
34. Edward Shuaka	Naiyobi
35. Saitoti Lekera	Naiyobi
36. Nailago Ole Kuraa	Naiyobi, women rep.
37. Sikona Peneti	Olbalbal, women rep.
38. Pakaay Olonyokie	Endulen, (PC – sec. & village chair, Endulen)
39. William Ole Seki	Endulen, PC treasurer
40. Naatemuta Nakuro	Naiyobi, women rep.
41. Sindiyo Moringe	Naiyobi, women rep.
42. Nailejileji Daudi	Naiyobi, women rep.

43. Meshuko Moses	Endulen, women rep.
44. Noomborro Olemeetalala	Endulen, women rep.
45. Nadaala	Kakesio
46. Runge Lengeju	Endulen, women rep.
47. Naalayok Orkiti	Kakesio, women, rep.
48. Noorpiyaya Ngairi	Endulen
49. Muriet Olesiyama	Nainokanoka
50. Sanago Olendolia	Nainokanoka
51. Dr. N. Ngowi	Private Senior Vet
52. Saimon Saitoti	PFO, Oloirobi
53. Lelya Musungui	Oloirobi
54. Katito Ole sokoi	Oloirobi, women rep.
55. Judith Kaisoe	Ereto
56. Paulina Gaspar	Oloirobi
57. Kesoi Medukenya	Oloirobi
58. Ng'atait Lerug	Oloirobi, alaigwanani
59. Sipapei Orkeri	Oloirobi
60. Kesen Ormeiki embere	Oloirobi
61. Nandet Kitisia	Oloirobi, ewoloto committee
62. Metui Ole Shaudo	Olbalbal, (councilor & PC chair)

Facilitators:

- | | |
|---------------------|-------------------------------|
| 1. Alais Morindat – | Irish Embassy, Dar es Salaam. |
| 2. Alfred Sakafu – | CASEC, Arusha. |